

Message

From: Sinks, Tom [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=001007B7D256453A8A19B91DF704E22C-SINKS, TOM]
Sent: 5/21/2018 12:32:00 PM
To: Hawkins, CherylA [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d917bee23e774e0dbb05ce06d694985e-Hawkins, CherylA]
CC: Greene, Mary [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=9aaa7190f96e4bfca7b06f8be3f35d45-Greene, Mary]; Kumar, Manisha [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=497133a6697a45f9bea221a07f4359f6-Kumar, Mani]
Subject: RE: Request re BYU Professor Pope & Proposed EPA Transparency Rule

Cheryl – I agree with you. Let's keep a folder of incomings that we do not forward to the docket with an explanation of why.

In this instance, an individual (Dr. Enstrom) sent a personal email to several scientists he has been challenging for several years regarding their past studies on air pollutants. He copied the OSA email box as a bcc. His email does not indicate that this information was intended for the docket nor does it provide any comment about the proposed rule.

From: Hawkins, CherylA
Sent: Friday, May 18, 2018 3:01 PM
To: Sinks, Tom <Sinks.Tom@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Request re BYU Professor Pope & Proposed EPA Transparency Rule

Now that I've read the email carefully, I don't believe we should respond nor send it to the docket. He is addressing other researchers and it isn't clear why it was sent to Staff_OSA, I assume we were a bcc.

Cheryl A. Hawkins, Ph.D.
US EPA/ORD/Office of the Science Advisor
RRB 41259
(202)564-7307
hawkins.cheryla@epa.gov

From: Staff_OSA
Sent: Friday, May 18, 2018 2:52 PM
To: Sinks, Tom <Sinks.Tom@epa.gov>
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA <Hawkins.CherylA@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Request re BYU Professor Pope & Proposed EPA Transparency Rule

Hi Tom,

We've received this email and would like your input on how to respond.

Best,

Cheryl & Manisha

From: James E. Enstrom [mailto:jenstrom@ucla.edu]
Sent: Thursday, May 17, 2018 1:00 PM
To: 'Michael R. Ransom' <ransom@byu.edu>
Cc: 'Brent W. Webb' <webb@byu.edu>; 'Barry R. Bickmore' <barry_bickmore@byu.edu>; 'Delbert J. Eatough' <delbert@eatough.net>; 'Benjamin D. Horne' <benjamin.horne@imail.org>; 'J. Brent Muhlestein' <brent.muhlestein@imail.org>; 'Kent E. Pinkerton' <kepinkerton@ucdavis.edu>; 'Susan M. Gapstur' <susan_gapstur@cancer.org>; 'Michael J. Thun' <michael.thun@cancer.org>; 'Jonathan M. Samet' <jon.samet@ucdenver.edu>; dgreenbaum@healtheffects.org
Subject: Request re BYU Professor Pope & Proposed EPA Transparency Rule

May 17, 2018

BYU President Kevin J. Worthen
BYU Professor Michael R. Ransom ransom@byu.edu
BYU Professor Brent W. Webb webb@byu.edu
BYU Professor Barry R. Bickmore barry_bickmore@byu.edu
BYU Professor Emeritus Delbert J. Eatough delbert@eatough.net
IMC Epidemiologist Benjamin D. Horne benjamin.horne@imail.org
U Utah Professor J. Brent Muhlestein brent.muhlestein@imail.org
UC Davis Professor Kent E. Pinkerton kepinkerton@ucdavis.edu
ACS VP Epidemiology Susan M. Gapstur susan_gapstur@cancer.org
ACS VP Epidemiology Emeritus Michael J. Thun michael.thun@cancer.org
Former EPA CASAC Chair Jonathan M. Samet jon.samet@ucdenver.edu
nobel laureate greenbaum dgreenbaum@healtheffects.org

Subject: Request re BYU Professor Pope and Proposed EPA Transparency Rule

Dear Colleagues of BYU Professor Clive Arden Pope III,

I am writing regarding the Proposed EPA Rule “Strengthening Transparency in Regulatory Science” (<https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2018/04/30/2018-09078/strengthening-transparency-in-regulatory-science>). The Summary of this Rule is “This document proposes a regulation intended to strengthen the transparency of EPA regulatory science. The proposed regulation provides that when EPA develops regulations, including regulations for which the public is likely to bear the cost of compliance, with regard to those scientific studies that are pivotal to the action being taken, EPA should ensure that the data underlying those are publicly available in a manner sufficient for independent validation.”

This rule is necessary in large part because Professor Pope and the American Cancer Society (ACS) have conducted ‘secret science’ epidemiologic research on fine particulate matter (PM2.5) and mortality that has been used by EPA to establish and tighten the 1997 PM2.5 National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS). My March 28, 2017 *Dose-Response* article “Fine Particulate Matter and Total Mortality in the Cancer Prevention Study Cohort Reanalysis” (<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1559325817693345>), based on my independent reanalysis of the 1982 ACS Cancer Prevention Study (CPS II) data, found that Professor Pope’s research is seriously flawed and does not support a scientific and public health basis for the PM2.5 NAAQS. My reanalysis clearly demonstrates the importance of access to underlying data and shows the need for the EPA Transparency Rule.

Since you have been involved in some way with Professor Pope’s PM2.5 health effects research, please email me as soon as possible your YES or NO answer to the following four questions:

- 1) Do you support the Proposed EPA Rule “Strengthening Transparency in Regulatory Science”?

- 2) Is there extensive valid evidence that contradicts Professor Pope's evidence relating PM2.5 to premature deaths?
- 3) Should Professor Pope be held fully accountable for the validity of his research relating PM2.5 to premature deaths?
- 4) Should Americans, particularly Californians, be relieved of PM2.5 regulations that are based on a scientifically invalid relationship of PM2.5 to premature deaths?

Please let me know if you need clarification of these questions or this request. Until you respond to the contrary, I will assume that your answers to all four questions are NO.

Thank you very much for your consideration of this important request.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE
UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute
[http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/
jenstrom@ucla.edu](http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/jenstrom@ucla.edu)
(310) 472-4274